



REPUBLIC OF THE PHILIPPINES
DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE
BUREAU OF CUSTOMS

A modernized and credible customs administration that upholds good governance and is among the world's best

Republic of the Philippines,

Seizure Identification
No. CFZ **192-2023**

-versus-

Shipment said to contain **“TERNO SHORTS KIDSWEAR MADE IN COTTON MANUFACTURED BY BENCH TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, CUSTOMIZED SOFA COVER MANUFACTURED BY TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, FLORAL LADIES T-SHIRT (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURER: BENCH – TUTUBAN MALL TUTUBAN CENTER MALL CLARO M RECTO AVENUE METRO MANILA 1000, CUSTOMIZED EMBROIDERY HANDBAGS, ETC.”** bound to Springdale, Arkansas, USA which will be shipped thru Federal Express (FedEx) Clark on 11 April 2023 under House Airway Bill No. 771808893770 but found to contain **18 pcs. LV and 3 pcs. Gucci bags, various sleepwear (3 sets Prada, 1 set Burberry, 3 sets Fendi, 1 set Gucci), 2 pcs. Chanel Hoody, 1 box Burberry and 2 boxes Fendi socks, 1 pc. MCM Gift Set**

Exporter/Shipper:
LORNABEL A. FELIX
1387 West Triangle, Quezon City 1116 PH
Claimant.

X-----X

DECISION

This resolves the seizure and forfeiture proceedings instituted against the above-captioned shipment for violation of Section 1113 (f) and (l) (3 & 4) of Republic Act (R.A.) No. 10863 otherwise known as the Customs Modernization and Tariff Act (CMTA).

As culled from the records, the material facts of the instant case are as follows:

On 11 April 2023, a shipment bound to Springdale, Arkansas, USA (Consignee: Jasper L. Sebastian) under House Airway Bill No. 771808893770 said to contain **“TERNO SHORTS KIDSWEAR MADE IN COTTON MANUFACTURED BY BENCH TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, CUSTOMIZED SOFA COVER MANUFACTURED BY TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, FLORAL LADIES T-SHIRT (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURER: BENCH – TUTUBAN MALL TUTUBAN CENTER MALL CLARO M RECTO AVENUE METRO MANILA 1000, CUSTOMIZED EMBROIDERY HANDBAGS, ETC.”** under the name of LORNABEL A. FELIX with address at 1387 West Triangle, Quezon City 1116 PH arrived at the Federal Express (FedEx) gateway facility and marked for verification/physical examination by the X-ray Inspector on duty.



On 20 April 2023, Trade Control Examiner Julius Ceasar Asuncion conducted physical examination on the subject shipment in the presence of representative from FedEx with the following findings:

AS DECLARED IN THE INVOICE	AS FOUND
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 9 PCS. TERNO SHORTS KIDSWEAR MADE IN COTTON MANUFACTURED BY BENCH TUTUBAN MALL CENTER • 7 PCS. CUSTOMIZED SOFA COVER MANUFACTURED BY TUTUBAN MALL CENTER • 8 PCS. FLORAL LADIES T-SHIRT (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURER: BENCH – TUTUBAN MALL TUTUBAN CENTER MALL, CLARO M. RECTO AVENUE, METRO MANILA, 1000 • 4 PCS. CUSTOMIZED EMBROIDERY HANDBAGS • 8 PCS. PLAIN COLOR SCRUB SUIT (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURED BY BENCH TUTUBAN MALL CENTER • 4 PCS. KIDS PENCIL CASE POUCH MANUFACTURED BY TAILORED PROJECT • 6 PCS. PLAIN BLACK COLORS MEN'S SANDO (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURER: BENCH – TUTUBAN MALL TUTUBAN CENTER MALL, CLARO M. RECTO AVENUE, METRO MANILA, 1000 • 3 PCS. CUSTOMIZED KIDS RATAN SLIPPERS – MANUFACTURED BY BENCH TUTUBAN MALL CENTER • 9 PCS. PLAIN COLORS KIDS TOWEL (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURED BY TAILORED PROJECT 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 18 pcs. LV bags • 3 pcs. Gucci bags • Various sleepwear (3 sets Prada, 1 set Burberry, 3 sets Fendi, 1 set Gucci) • 2 pcs. Chanel Hoody • 1 box Burberry socks • 2 boxes Fendi socks • 1 pc. MCM Gift Set
<p>Value: USD 200.00 Gross Weight: 22 kgs.</p>	

Based on the abovementioned discrepancy between the goods found during the physical examination and goods declared in the commercial invoice, Ms. Maricar Go, Officer-In-Charge (OIC) Export Unit, and Trade Control Examiner Asuncion, thru Atty. Lilibeth Sandag, Deputy Collector for Operations, submitted a Memorandum dated 05 May 2023 recommending the issuance of a WSD against the subject shipment for violation of Section 1113 (l) (3) and (4) of the CMTA.

On 08 May 2023, a WSD docketed as Seizure Identification (S.I.) No. CFZ 192-2023 was issued by then Officer-In-Charge of this Port, Collector John Simon, against the subject shipment.



Thereafter, hearings were scheduled on 07 and 08 June 2023, however, no representative from claimant (exporter/shipper) appeared on the appointed date of the hearing.

In a Disposition Form dated 04 October 2023 from SP/Capt. Arnel A. Baylosis, District Commander, this Port, it is stated that the WSD and Notice of Hearing were not served because the exporter/shipper and address are fictitious/insufficient.

Thus, we resolve.

ISSUE:

Whether or not the subject shipment may be forfeited in favor of the government.

DISCUSSION:

In quasi-judicial proceedings, procedural rules governing service of notices/summons are not strictly construed. Substantial compliance thereof is sufficient. The constitutional requirement of due process with respect to service of summons only exacts that the service of summons be such as may reasonably be expected to give the notice desired.

In the case at hand, records show that serving of the WSD and Notice of Hearing was unsuccessful considering that the exporter/shipper and address are fictitious/insufficient. Hence, the same were posted at the FedEx, and BOC Bulletin Board and Official Website in compliance with Sections 6.5.2 and 10.13 of Customs Administrative Order (CAO) No. 10-2020, to wit:

6.5.2. x x x If the owner is unknown, with insufficient address, or a foreign entity or individual, service shall be effected by posting of the WSD by the ESS in the bulletin board of the concerned collection district office, and by electronic posting through the BOC website, or printed publication, for fifteen (15) days.

10.13. Notice of Hearing shall be served by personal service or, if not practicable by reason of distance and lack of personnel to effect personal service, by private courier service; or posting in the bulletin board of the Law Division or equivalent office of the concerned Collection District for unknown claimants, with insufficient address or foreign claimants. x x x

Moreover, Section 1121 of the CMTA and Section 9.4 of the same CAO provides that “If, within fifteen (15) days calendar days after service of warrant and due notice, no owner or agent can be found or appears before the District Collector, the seized goods shall be forfeited *ipso facto* in favor of the government to be disposed of in accordance with the CMTA.”

In this case, since no claimant appeared despite due notice and service of warrant, the seized goods should be forfeited *ipso facto* in favor of the government and disposed of in accordance with the law.



Furthermore, the subject shipment was declared in the commercial invoice as “TERNO SHORTS KIDSWEAR MADE IN COTTON MANUFACTURED BY BENCH TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, CUSTOMIZED SOFA COVER MANUFACTURED BY TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, FLORAL LADIES T-SHIRT (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURER: BENCH – TUTUBAN MALL TUTUBAN CENTER MALL CLARO M RECTO AVENUE METRO MANILA 1000, CUSTOMIZED EMBROIDERY HANDBAGS, ETC.” contrary to the findings of Trade Control Examiner Asuncion that the same contained **18 pcs. LV and 3 pcs. Gucci bags, various sleepwear (3 sets Prada, 1 set Burberry, 3 sets Fendi, 1 set Gucci), 2 pcs. Chanel Hoody, 1 box Burberry and 2 boxes Fendi socks, 1 pc. MCM Gift Set.** As such, the same are considered goods subject to seizure and forfeiture under Section 1113 (f) and (l) (3 & 4) of the CMTA, to wit:

SEC. 1113. Property Subject to Seizure and Forfeiture. –

Property that shall be subject to seizure and forfeiture include:

xxx

(f) Goods, the importation or exportation of which are effected or attempted contrary to law, or any goods of prohibited importation or exportation, and all other goods which, in the opinion of the District Collector, have been used, are or were entered to be used as instruments in the importation or the exportation of the former.

xxx

(l) Goods sought to be imported or exported:

(3) Through a false declaration or affidavit executed by the owner, importer, exporter, or consignee concerning the importation of such goods;

(4) On the strength of a false invoice or other document executed by the owner, importer, exporter, or consignee concerning the importation or exportation of such goods; or

xxx

All told, this Office finds it proper to forfeit the subject shipment for violation of Section 1113 (f) and (l) (3 & 4) of the CMTA.

WHEREFORE, by virtue of the authority vested in me by law, it is hereby ordered and decreed that **shipment said to contain “TERNO SHORTS KIDSWEAR MADE IN COTTON MANUFACTURED BY BENCH TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, CUSTOMIZED SOFA COVER MANUFACTURED BY TUTUBAN MALL CENTER, FLORAL LADIES T-SHIRT (100% COTTON) MANUFACTURER: BENCH – TUTUBAN MALL TUTUBAN CENTER MALL CLARO M RECTO AVENUE METRO MANILA 1000, CUSTOMIZED EMBROIDERY HANDBAGS, ETC.” bound to Springdale, Arkansas, USA which will be shipped thru Federal Express (FedEx) Clark on 11 April 2023 under House Airway Bill No. 771808893770 but found to contain 18 pcs. LV and 3 pcs. Gucci**



bags, various sleepwear (3 sets Prada, 1 set Burberry, 3 sets Fendi, 1 set Gucci), 2 pcs. Chanel Hoody, 1 box Burberry and 2 boxes Fendi socks, 1 pc. MCM Gift Set, subject of this seizure and forfeiture proceeding, be **FORFEITED** in favor of the Government to be disposed of in the manner provided for by law.

Let copies of the Order be furnished to all parties and offices for their information.

SO ORDERED.

Port of Clark International Airport, Clark Freeport Zone, Pampanga,
_____.


ATTY. ERASTUS SANDINO B. AUSTRIA, CESO V
District Collector, Port of Clark

Copy furnished:

1. Owner/Consignee/Shipper
2. Unit/Office in Custody of the Goods
3. Chief, ACDD



BOC-CRK-23-00502

